

Limited Architectural Competition



The Cathedral of the Good Shepherd, Dalmilling Crescent, Ayr

Purpose of the Competition

The Roman Catholic Bishop of Galloway recently approached South Ayrshire Council regarding future options for the Cathedral of the Good Shepherd in Ayr. The Cathedral exceeds the requirements of its present-day congregation and it will shortly require the costly replacement of its roof. An option for the Bishop is to re-locate the Cathedral whilst possibly maintaining a more modest place of worship at Dalmilling Crescent. He is interested in exploring the opportunities to develop generally the site for socially beneficial purposes. Given its proximity to the John Pollock Centre, a large-scale general community facility does not appear to be an obvious possibility. Hence the approach to Carrick Housing Association to consider the opportunities for incorporating affordable rented housing on the site. It should, however, be emphasised that at this stage no decision regarding future of the Cathedral has been made. This is very much an ideas competition. There is no guarantee that any of the proposals generated will be realised.

The site is well located in terms of local amenities; it thus lends itself to the provision of houses accessible to, for example, the elderly or the disabled. The Cathedral is listed as of architectural or historic interest (category C). This together with the desire for a place of worship (possibly combined with other facilities) raises particular design and viability issues which require to be fully resolved before a commitment could be made by, in particular, Communities Scotland to support a Housing Association development.

Any proposals for change are likely to raise issues for both the congregation and the community at large. Carrick considers that the sensitivity and complexity of the site provides an opportunity to engage actively with the community in resolving the issue of the site's long-term future.

The process we propose is a limited (ie by invitation) architectural competition to produce design options within a broad but deliverable framework. In order to keep the process both manageable and accessible to a lay audience, three firms are invited to submit ideas with the benefit of an honorarium each.

Community involvement will be sought in number of ways, eg:

- An exhibition and presentations through which comment can be sought. This may be extended through the *North Ayr Compass* newspaper.
- Direct community representation in the competition assessment panel.

Whilst this is an ideas competition, Carrick is still seeking proposals which are capable of being built under the current Communities Scotland yardsticks. On the one hand, this may militate against innovation in terms of space or building systems; on the other, it allows the potential (and limitations) to "add value" to current housing association production to be addressed clearly.

Brief

Accommodation:

- One and two bed roomed housing aimed at the elderly.
- An economical flexible building capable of being used as both a centre for social services and for community events (including religious services). The main space should be capable of accommodating 100 people theatre style, and of being easily subdivided to provide day centre facilities, eg meeting and consultation rooms.

Flexibility and Adaptability:

- The design of the housing units should be capable of accommodating the desires and requirements of elderly households over time. South Ayrshire Council is committed to an independent living model for social care in which elderly people with disabilities and a requirement for support can still enjoy the benefits of their own self-contained home. This includes a policy objective of ensuring "that "dementia friendly" design features are built into a proportion of all new housing stock" (Joint Community Care Plan, 2001/2004).
- Proposals should provide for a minimum of one third of the dwellings having a second bedroom. This is to allow for the different living arrangements including the needs of formal and informal over-night carers.
- Public and private spaces should address the issues of safety, security, and sociability combined with opportunities for privacy.
- The public building should be functionally discrete yet architecturally integrated with the residential uses.

Sustainability

- A positive approach to maximising energy efficiency in construction and long-term use is expected.

Deliverability

- The housing component should be realisable with reference to the funding constraints described in the Association's Design Guide (November 2001).
- An economical approach should be assumed with regard to the construction and possible reuse of the day centre.

Planning Considerations

The Cathedral is listed Category C (S). A copy of the listing description is supplied. The Listing extends to the boundary walls, railings, gate piers and gates. It does not, however, include the Priest's House and Church Hall.

Within the South Ayrshire Local Plan (draft for public consultation, 1999), the site and surrounding area are covered by Policy H8 which seeks to preserve the character of residential areas. By virtue of its listing the building is also subject to Policies ENV38, ENV39 and ENV 40. Advice can be obtained from Mrs Catherine Parish of SAC, tel: 01292 616173. Catherine.Parish@south-ayrshire.gov.uk

ENV38: The Council will seek to protect and promote the protection of the fabric of Listed buildings and will actively encourage the sensitive restoration and reuse of all such properties unless it can be demonstrated to the satisfaction of the Council that an alternative course of action can be justified.

ENV39: In the context of Policy ENV38 the demolition of a Listed building will normally only be approved when in association with the approval of detailed redevelopment proposals.

ENV40: Where the demolition of a listed building is proposed in association with the redevelopment of the site, its replacement shall be of a quality design, commensurate with that of the original building.

The Site and Existing Buildings

The Cathedral and ancillary buildings occupy a triangular site contained by Dalmilling Crescent and Dalmilling Road (map reference NS 3580 2263). A topographic survey is supplied in paper and digital forms. This shows the existing buildings, boundaries and relationship to the surrounding buildings. Dalmilling is a housing scheme in the northeast of Ayr which was developed by the former Burgh Council largely from the late 1940s to the 1960s.

Three related buildings occupy the site:

- **The Cathedral**



The Ayr Burgh Council Dean of Guild approved drawings are available for inspection at the Ayrshire Archives Centre, Craigie Estate, Ayr (01292 287584). The reference number is 81 (1954).

Originally designed by William Cowie and Torry (and credited to Fred Torry) as a parish church, it was elevated to Cathedral status in 1961. Construction was completed in 1957, although the Dean of Guild drawings are dated 1951 (approved 1954). It is described in the Listing schedule as “..a good example of post-war architecture with its distinctive brick work and cream stone detailing, ennobled by its fine square plan tower.” Rob Close in *Ayrshire and Arran, An Illustrated Architectural Guide* (RIAS, 1992) comments, however, on “.. this long, low, and unambitious building has standard metal windows and a low tower capped by a chimneylike turret” (p35). Its construction reflects the stringencies of the post-war reconstruction phase. It is of predominantly brick construction. The brick piers forming the arcades encase steel “H” posts. The intermediate floors and roof of the tower are of concrete. The roof consists of steel truces (with a horizontal ceiling below), asbestos concrete decking and copper weathering extending to the parapet gutters. It is understood that the copper requires to be replaced in its entirety. As designed, it could accommodate a congregation of 1,100.

- **Priest’s House**



The Ayr Burgh Council Dean of Guild approved drawing is available for inspection at the Ayrshire Archives Centre, Craigie Estate, Ayr (01292 287584). The reference number is 31 (1955). The drawing is dated 1954.

This is a large simple two-storey house with single storey wings to the west and north (linking to the Cathedral). It is of brick cavity construction with timber floors and roof structure. The roof is finished in red tiles. As noted above it is not subject to Listing.

- **Church Hall**

This is a simple brick building is of later design and construction. As noted above, it is not subject to listing.



Procedure

- **Entrants**

The competition is restricted to submissions from:

- ARP Lorimer and Associates
- Alastair Murdoch Partnership
- Wren Rutherford A-S:L

- **Deadline for Submissions**

The competition will be formally launched on 29 April 2002. The closing date for submissions to the Association's office is 24 June 2002.

- **Selection Process**

- Exhibition. In conjunction with the North Ayr Partnership, an exhibition and presentation will be held to gauge community reactions to the proposals.
- Cost Check. Although this is an ideas competition, it is important that the proposals have a good prospect of being deliverable within Communities Scotland's current cost limits. Carrick will therefore carryout an outline cost appraisal of each submission.
- Formal judging. The panel will consider the submissions with regard to the following criteria:
 - Success at meeting or exceeding the requirements of the brief.
 - Community responses.
 - Deliverability in terms of economic and Planning considerations.

- **Judging Panel**

The panel will consist of representatives of the Association, the local community, the North Ayr Partnership and the Roman Catholic Church. Karen Anderson of Anderson Bell + Christie will act as architectural assessor.

- **Announcement of the Winner**

The aim will be to announce the winner by 31 July 2002.

- **Honoraria**

£1,200 (inclusive of VAT) will be paid to each entrant.

- **Prize**

£1,200 (including VAT) will be paid to the winner. Whilst no guarantees can be given at this stage, if the project does proceed, it would be the Association's intention to appoint the winning practice (subject to continued compliance with its quality assurance requirements). In such an eventuality, the prize should be treated as a payment of fees to account.

- **Copyright**

The entrants shall retain the copyright of their design proposals. It is a condition of the competition, however, that the entrants will grant an irrevocable free licence to the Association to reproduce the designs and any other submitted material for the purpose of reporting the competition to the general public.

- **Briefing Session**

The Association will organise a separate briefing session and site visit for each entrant in the week beginning 6 May. Following these, a note of answers to all questions raised will be circulated to the entrants.

- **Questions**

In addition to the above, questions may be submitted to the Association in the period to 10 June 2002. These should be in the form of e-mails to d.mclean@carrickha.org.uk. Answers together with a copy of the question will be circulated (by e-mail) to all entrants.

- **Access to the Site and Buildings**

Access to the buildings can be obtained at the convenience of the resident priest, Father McGee (01292 265716).

- **Submission Requirements**

The minimum information requirements are:

- Analytical drawings
- Key exterior and interior perspectives
- 1:200 site plan and/or axonometric
- 1:100 floor plans
- 1:100 elevations
- 1:100 sections
- 1:50 plans typical unit types
- 1:50 section typical unit types

Submissions should be contained within a maximum of 4 mounted A1 panels.

- Models

These should not be submitted. Photographs of models may however be contained in the submitted panels.

- Project report

An A3 report should be submitted. Six paper copies and (if possible) a PDF file should be supplied. This should contain:

- A schedule of accommodation (housing accommodation referenced to the New Scottish Housing Handbook, Bulletin 1).
- Reductions of the drawings contained in the submitted panels.
- A description of the design concept. This should cover, inter alia:
 - The reconciliation of past and proposed uses on the site.
 - The relationship of the proposal to its surroundings.



- How the changing and varied lifestyles and needs of the client group are met through the design of individual dwellings, day facilities, and public and private open space.
- The opportunities for innovation in construction.
- The opportunities to minimise short (construction) and long term (occupation) energy use.

Entrants are reminded that their proposals should be presented in a form which communicates with a lay audience.

Carrick Housing Association Ltd, 13 Miller Road, Ayr, KA7 2AX

Tel: 01292 880 120

Fax: 01292 880 121

info@carrickha.org.uk

www.carrickha.org.uk

26 April 2002